

ALPINE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
Alpine City Hall, 20 North Main, Alpine, UT
December 1, 2020

I. GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Welcome and Roll Call: The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chairwoman Jane Griener. The following were present and constituted a quorum:

Chairwoman: Jane Griener

Commission Members: Alan MacDonald, Ethan Allen, John MacKay, Troy Slade, Ed Bush, Sylvia Christiansen

Excused:

Staff: Austin Roy, Jed Muhlestein, Marla Fox

Others: Paul Anderson

B. Prayer/Opening Comments: Ed Bush

C. Pledge of Allegiance: Alan MacDonald

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments.

III. ACTION ITEMS

A. Alpine Fitness – Site Plan – Paul Anderson

Austin Roy said this item is returning to Planning Commission following the City Council review of the Site Plan on November 24, 2020. The City Council asked that the Planning Commission take another look at the design of the building with regards to the Gateway Historic District Design Guidelines. He said the City Council had concerns about the trail and where it would be located next to the creek. They also wanted to know how this proposed building met the Historic Guidelines.

The Gateway Historic District Design Guidelines are in the following eight categories:

1. Relation to the Surrounding Area (Massing, Scale, Orientation)
2. Height
3. Exterior Walls and Surfaces
4. Windows and Doors
5. Exterior Trim and Decorative Detailing
6. Roofing
7. Materials (Texture, Color, Finishes)
8. Streetscaping

The Applicant was seeking to relocate Alpine Fitness and Alpine Physical Therapy to a new building on Main Street. The new building would replace an existing garage structure on the site. The existing building would be demolished, and the new building would be located at the same site as the current building. The site was located within the Business Commercial Zone and the Gateway Historic District. The proposed building was approximately 9,380 square feet on a parcel approximately 0.58 acres in size.

There were 40 off-street parking stalls that were proposed. The developer was seeking approval of the proposed site plan.

In August of 2019, the City Council approved a 15-foot front setback exception on Main Street and a two-foot setback exception on the north property line. In September of 2019, the City Council approved a parking exception (parking allowed in front setback) and land swap on the property. The land swap was granted to allow for the power lines on the property to be relocated underground. The proposed building had been designed with these exceptions in mind.

The Applicant worked with the gas company to remove a high-pressure gas line from the property and the easement that existed for the gas line had been vacated.

During the meeting, Paul Anderson provided a detailed description of the proposal, answering questions as he went along. There were questions on details such as the face of the building, the foundation, columns, setbacks, doors, windows, roofline, and other structural and design elements. Visuals accompanied the discussion. Other buildings in the City which were constructed per the Historic Guidelines were compared to the current building proposal. These included the Mountainville Academy, the Pine Valley Realty building, and the two Ezra Lee buildings. Discussion ensued on the design of the proposed building and if they wanted to recommend any changes. They reviewed the roofline and the pitch of the overhang and said it was personal style but met the criteria. They said they would like to see more design elements on the east side instead of just a wall of metal siding.

Chairwoman Griener emphasized open-mindedness in the discussion. A lot of time and energy has been applied to the current proposal. The Planning Commission had an obligation to the Applicant to do the best possible job of submitting to the City Council an approvable project. The building did not need to be completely re-designed; however, a few minor changes, as well as a detailed explanation as to how the design meets the criteria of the guidelines, were the goals. The end result should be a beautiful building, which followed the criteria, and could therefore be approved.

Ed Bush said Mr. Anderson checked the boxes of the design criteria. He said the City Council didn't think it was a Historic design but more of a modern look. He said he did not think other elements needed to be added because he believed less was more but said he would be in favor of breaking up the siding on the east side.

Alan MacDonald said Mr. Anderson had done an admirable job and had met the design criteria on a difficult lot which was an eye sore. He said his architectural elements were consistent with other buildings in the district. He agreed to break up the east side with some other design element.

John MacKay said it checked all the boxes. He said this design met the guidelines and the renderings did not show the impact of the windows and showed the variety of the design. He said adding the landscaping would add to it as well. He suggested painting the fire door a different color.

Troy Slade said he agreed with all the comments. He said he was not a designer and did not feel qualified in that area. He said he would like to see an architectural feature on the front to add dimension. He said Mr. Anderson's building would fit right in and be a jewel in the middle of town.

Sylvia Christiansen said everyone was going to have a different design idea and felt like this building would be a jewel for the City.

Ethan Allen said he agreed with everyone's comments. He said it met the design criteria and said it was an interesting design and he was in favor of it.

Chairwoman Griener noted the value of having 3-D renderings in the future, for discussions such as this. She said she was not sure how this building fit in with other buildings in the City. She said canopies or awnings could add a design element that would satisfy the guidelines. She said planters, with trees and shrubs could soften up surfaces as well. She asked about the landscaping plan and if it could be adjusted to bring more landscaping up front instead of at the back. She also said she thought a sidewalk was required leading to the fire door.

It was important to remember that the Gateway Historic District Design Guidelines was not code. It was only an aid in making decisions.

MOTION: Ethan Allen moved to recommend approval of the proposed site plan for the Alpine Fitness building with the option of the City Council to make design changes. Troy Slade seconded the motion. The motion died.

The ultimate decision remained with Paul Anderson. He had sat through two Planning Commission meetings and a City Council meeting. He could pull all of the recommendations together, make changes as he desired, and see if it passed.

MOTION: Alan MacDonald moved to recommend approval of the proposed Site Plan for the Alpine Fitness building. John MacKay seconded the motion. There were 6 Ayes and 1 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed.

Ayes:

Alan MacDonald
Ed Bush
Ethan Allen
Troy Slade
John MacKay
Sylvia Christiansen

Nays:

Jane Griener

B. Annual Meeting Schedule 2021

Austin Roy presented the 2021 Planning Commission Calendar showing the holidays and dates that might not work for meetings. The meetings for this body were scheduled according to the school calendar, to avoid absences that may occur by families going on vacation.

MOTION: Sylvia Christiansen moved to approve the Annual Meeting Schedule for 2021. Ethan Allen seconded the motion. There were 7 Ayes and 0 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed unanimously.

Ayes:

Alan MacDonald
Jane Griener
Ed Bush
Ethan Allen
Troy Slade
John MacKay
Sylvia Christiansen

Nays:

IV. Communication

No comments

V. APPROVAL OF PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES: November 17, 2020

MOTION: Troy Slade moved to approve the minutes for November 17, 2020 with changes noted made by Jed Muhlestein and Sylvia Christiansen.

Alan MacDonald seconded the motion. There were 7 Ayes and 0 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed unanimously.

Ayes:

Alan MacDonald
Ethan Allen
Jane Griener
Troy Slade
Ed Bush
John MacKay
Sylvia Christiansen

Nays:

None

MOTION: Alan MacDonald moved to adjourn the meeting. Ethan Allen seconded the motion. There were 7 Ayes and 0 Nays (recorded below). The motion passed unanimously.

Ayes:

Alan MacDonald
Ethan Allen
Jane Griener
Troy Slade
Ed Bush
John MacKay
Sylvia Christiansen

Nays:

None

The meeting was adjourned at 9:26 p.m. The next meeting will be in 2021.