

**ALPINE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING at  
Alpine City Hall, 20 North Main, Alpine, Utah  
September 1, 2015**

**I. GENERAL BUSINESS**

**A. Welcome and Roll Call:** The meeting was called to order at 7:00pm by Chairman Steve Cospers. The following commission members were present and constituted a quorum.

Chairman: Steve Cospers

Commission Members: Bryce Higbee, Jason Thelin, David Fotheringham, Steve Cospers, Jane Griener, Steve Swanson, Judi Pickell

Commission Members Not Present: Judi Pickell, Steve Swanson

Staff: Jed Muhlestein, Jason Bond, Marla Fox

Others: Roger Bennett, Lon Lott, Will Jones, Lloyd Wilson, JoAnn Burgess Chilton, Vanee Burgess Ashby, Roger Whitby, Clive Walters, Jewel Walters, Alan Wood, Dale Fillmore, Brent Callister, Loraine Lott, Sherry Boren, Kip Egan, Gale Rudolph, Marianna Richardson

**B. Prayer/Opening Comments:** Bryce Higbee

**C. Pledge of Allegiance:** Steve Cospers

**II. PUBLIC COMMENT**

No comment

**III. ACTION ITEMS**

**A. PUBLIC HEARING – Westfield Zone Change Request**

Residents with property located along Westfield Road and 200 north are requesting that the zoning for their property be changed from CR-40,000 zone to CR-20,000 zone. The ordinance requires that the Planning Commission make a recommendation to the City Council. The City Council may approve or deny the proposed amendment to the zoning map, either as proposed by the Planning Commission or after making any revision the City Council considers appropriate.

Jason Bond said the boundary request has expanded and he showed a list of the neighbors who signed a petition for zone change and showed where this zone is on the map. Jane Griener asked how many acres were included in the area. Jason Bond said approximately forty eight acres.

Steve Cospers asked what the potential for future growth of the remaining raw land was. Jed Muhlestein said he would look into it to find an accurate answer. Jason Bond showed on the map all the one acre zones and said rezoning this Westfield area wouldn't set a precedence because each application is different and up to the Planning Commission and City Council to decide the outcome. The Planning Commission had a discussion about the surrounding neighborhoods and if open space would be needed through a PRD. Jason Bond said he didn't see a reason for it because the property is right next to Burgess Park.

Steve Cospers opened the Public Hearing.

JoAnn Burgess Chilton said she and her husband donated the land for Burgess Park and she said the ground for Timberland Jr. High School was also their property and it was under condemnation. She said her ground has already been given and donated to the city.

Clive Walters said he owns the largest parcel in this area which is just over sixteen acres. He said given the area this property is in, it makes sense to zone to half acres. He said fanning out from one acre lots to half acre lots would be appropriate.

Kip Egan said he would like to appeal to the Alpine leaders to provide affordable housing to the second generation. He said we have a lot of expensive large lots and homes and housing for seniors, but nothing for the younger

generation who grew up here and would like to stay here. He said we are replacing Alpiners for people who don't know about our history and culture.

Dana Beck said when he purchased his property it was zoned half acre. He said Mayor Barnes had the area rezoned and didn't know his property was rezoned for four or five years. He said by rezoning this property back to half acre, it would fit in with the surrounding area and complete the original bullseye planning.

Gail Rudolph said she travels down Westfield several times a day and said rezoning to smaller lots will create a lot of traffic and will use a lot of water which we all have to share and use on certain days. She said we would go from forty eight houses to one hundred houses and said that's way too many homes to go into that area. She said it doesn't fit with the character of the Master Plan because the Master Plan advertises low density.

Kip Egan asked about water use and how much water it would take to support a one acre lot versus a half acre lot. Steve Cospers asked Jed Muhlestein to cover that topic during Planning Commission member comments.

Ms. Diamond said she purchased her home knowing the vacant lots behind her home would be one acre lots. She said she opposes half acre lots because it's double the density with more traffic.

Dale Fillmore asked if changing this zone will affect the schools and their planning and is it part of the master planning. He wanted to know what the impact would be to the roads, traffic and the schools.

Lloyd Wilson said he would love to live in Alpine but it is above his budget. He is part of the Burgess family and said he would like to be able to live on family property. He said it would be more realistic to reach his dream if this area was rezoned half acre.

Steve Cospers closed the Public Hearing.

Steve Cospers said he is confused about the argument of people not being able to afford living here. He said half acres are going for about \$300,000 and acre and one acre are going for about \$400,000. He said his daughter purchased an older home for under \$300,000. He said the second generation probably can't afford the home their parents have but they can still live in Alpine in a smaller existing home.

Jason Thelin said when the Loveland property wanted to build townhomes, we asked if they would be affordable to second generation and we were told no. So even if we put in smaller lots, it doesn't mean it will be affordable. Steve Cospers said Alpine needs to decide if they want more families here or more open space.

Jane Griener said new homes are not necessarily affordable and sometimes big homes are built on small lots. She said she herself had to buy an existing home in order to be able to afford living here. She mentioned that there is a lot of traffic getting in and out of Timberline and also wanted to know what happens when schools reach capacity. Steve Cospers said they would have to provide service and fortunately that is not our concern. Jason Thelin said if the Westfield properties are developed, it would decrease the traffic congestion because the development would create a new road and another way to get traffic in and out of the area. Bryce Higbee said Alpine is decreasing in school age children so the grades coming up will not be as full.

Jason Thelin asked Dana Beck what his reasoning was for rezoning his property. Dana Beck said he would like smaller lots because he has six children he would like to put on his property. He said he is an eight generation Alpiners and would like to see the ninth and tenth generations of his family be able to live here. He said smaller lots would be more affordable for those kids.

Jason Thelin said he sees this as a benefit for the land owners but outside of that it's not affordable from a cost perspective. He said the second problem is there is more culinary water use for half acres and the third problem is more traffic and that is not a positive trade for higher density.

Jed Muhlestein said the traffic studies that have been done that show Alpine roads have a quality of A which means great service. He said going from one acre to half acre isn't going to hurt the level of service. Jed Muhlestein said the water would be about a wash because these homes would use more culinary water but less secondary water

which is harder to come by. Jed Muhlestein said the undeveloped land is being used for alfalfa which uses more secondary water than a landscaped yard.

Gail Rudolph said new growth on the north end of Alpine will also use Westfield Road adding to increased traffic. She asked the Planning Commission to consider that when making a decision to increase density. Bryce Higbee said there are other outlets for those people to get out of the city besides using Westfield Road.

Jane Griener asked how the Planning Commission liked using a survey to help make their decision. She said she can see how this could fit in the area but has concerns about rezoning without looking more closely at the Master Plan or gathering feedback from a survey. Jason Thelin said this situation hasn't come up too often but when it has, we have not downsized.

David Fotheringham said it doesn't hurt to take another look at the General Plan but he also wants to look seriously at this request because of the applicants. He said they are old Alpiners who have lived here forever and said this will need some consideration. Steve Cosper said this is a serious request and needs some serious consideration but said it feels rushed because it is such a big decision.

Jason Thelin said he is concerned because there is a tremendous respect for the families involved in this property, but with that said, he doesn't want to rush a decision or set a precedence because of who these families are. He said we have to make a decision that is good for all the city and for future decisions. Bryce Higbee said he doesn't think this goes against our General Plan. He said Alpine is not against half acre lots, the General Plan is talking about low density condos and apartments.

Kip Egan said Alpine is aging and thinks we need to downzone and bring the younger generation into the city. Alan Wood said he is not receptive to down zoning because he is concerned about traffic and the overall integrity of the area and would like the city to maintain the one acre zoning.

Steve Cosper said he thinks we need more time to make this decision. He said this feels too rushed and he wants to make a good decision. He said he respects the work that's been done but feels like there is more work to do.

**MOTION:** Jason Thelin moved to recommend to the City Council to deny the Westfield Zone Change Request to rezone properties located along Westfield Road and 200 north changing from CR-40,000 zone to CR-20,000 zone.

Jane Griener seconded the motion. The motion did not pass with 3 Ayes and 2 Nays. Jason Thelin, Steve Cosper, and Jane Griener, all voted Aye. Bryce Higbee and David Fotheringham voted Nay.

### **B. Business/Commercial Zone Boundary Discussion**

The boundaries of the Business/Commercial zone have been discussed by both the Planning Commission and the City Council. This topic has come up because there are a number of residences that are in the B/C zone which conflicts with the legislative intent of the zone. At the last City Council meeting, the Council Members asked that the Planning Commission work on addressing the boundaries of the B/C zone. They were also not in favor of the idea of having the Gateway Historic boundaries different than the B/C boundaries.

Jason Bond showed on the map a cleaned up version of the Business Commercial zone that showed some residential area taken out. Steve Cosper asked if there is anyone in a residential home that would be upset about being taken out of the Commercial zone. Jason Bond said he hasn't talked to anyone in the zone about it. He said the Senior Housing area would still be included along with some residential mixed in with Commercial buildings.

Jason Bond said there are a few spots in town that straddle two zones that need to be cleaned up. He also wanted to know if the half acres in the one acre zone in Twin Rivers could be zoned half acre to prevent confusion. He said these lots are half acre because of a PRD but are still in the one acre zone.

Jason Thelin wanted to know if this is driven by the City Council. Jason Bond said yes, the Council asked the Planning Commission to look at the boundaries. He also said typically Commercial property is more valuable so he wonders if residential properties would like to remain in the B/C zone because they would have more options. He said he has never heard of someone saying to take them out of the Commercial zone.

Bryce Higbee said sometimes it could hurt the value of the residential home depending on where the home is located in the Commercial zone and what business it's next to. He also said it could affect the Commercial businesses because they have to contend with a home in the back of their business. He said he doesn't like losing ground and trimming down the Commercial zone when we're not sure if we will ever gain any more in the future. He also said he likes having the road as a buffer between residential and commercial property.

Jane Griener said she would not like to see her property back up to a Commercial business because of safety reasons but said if the zone was smaller, it would force businesses onto Main Street.

Vaney Burgess Ashby said her family has live in Alpine for 100 years and she doesn't see her family home becoming a Commercial business. She said she sees the home being used as residential for many generations to come.

David Fotheringham said a business may have parking issues on Main Street and may need to use the lot behind the business for parking so he thinks those lots should stay in the Commercial zone. The Planning Commission discussed which areas they thought should stay in the Commercial zone and which ones should be taken out. Steve Cosper said it doesn't make sense to take out a few lots here and there and thought it best to leave it as it is.

**MOTION:** David Fotheringham moved to leave the Business Commercial zone as it is.

Bryce Higbee seconded the motion. The motion was not unanimous but passed with 4 Ayes and 1 Nay. Bryce Higbee, Jason Thelin, David Fotheringham, and Steve Cosper all voted Aye. Jane Griener voted Nay

**COMMUNICATION:**

Jason Bond said Mayor Watkins asked him to create a survey about different issues in the city to go out to the citizens of Alpine. Jason Thelin wanted to know if this is being done to help with the General Plan. Jason Bond said this is Mayor Watkin's survey. Jane Griener said the Mayor wants to get a feel from the community. Steve Cosper said it still had the Planning Commission and the City Council on the top of the survey. Jason Bond said he thinks the Mayor wants the Planning commission and the City Council to learn something from the survey.

Jane Griener asked the Planning Commission what they think about surveys and do they think it would help in decision making. Bryce Higbee said this survey is good for City Council but not for Planning Commission because Planning Commission has to follow the ordinances no matter what the public opinion is. He said if 400 people vote a certain way and it goes against the ordinance, we have to follow the ordinance. He said the Planning Commission should not be swayed to vote a certain way based on public opinion.

Jason Bond said we have to be careful with public clamber because it can be a very harmful thing. He said if an applicant wants to do something according to our ordinance and you have the whole city show up with pitchforks and torches and they say they don't want that, and we make a decision to go against our own ordinance because of the public clamber, that's where we put the city in trouble.

Jane Griener said we have to be careful saying public opinion is public clamber because they are the citizens of the city. Jason Bond said public opinion is important when we're making law; when it's legislative. He said when it has to do with an ordinance, we have to follow the ordinance. Jane Griener said the benefit of a survey is to get all the peoples opinion and not just the people who come to the meeting. Bryce Higbee said you have to be careful because surveys can be worded in a way that can push people to respond in a certain way and that is harmful.

Steve Cosper said on the zone change, he would have rather had a Planning Commission discussion first and had the engineers research this before bringing in the property owners. He did say that he understand that the applicants had a right to be on the agenda and ask for the zone change but he felt pressured to make a decision and he said he feels like this issues needs more time. He said we need to use good planning principles for the future of the city and good planning is not swayed by public opinion.

Bryce Higbee said this is not the same Alpine he grew up in where he could ride his 4 wheeler on dirt roads. He said his kids will grow up in a different Alpine and he is okay with that. He said the city is eighty percent built out and if it can handle half acres with the extra traffic and water issues then why not down zone.

The Planning Commission had a discussion about the Master Plan, and if it should be updated because some of the definitions aren't clear. The Master Plan talks about high and low density but doesn't go into detail or explain what Alpine considers high or low density.

Jane Griener said we should be planning the city that the people want. She said the Master Plan should be updated so we feel confident in using it. She also said most of the people petitioning for a zone change are in real estate and have a vested interest in what happens with the property.

Jed Muhlestein said you need to focus on the facts like water, sewer, irrigation, and traffic to help make the decision.

**VI. APPROVAL OF PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES OF:** August 18, 2015

**MOTION:** Jane Griener moved to approve the Planning Commission Minutes for August 18, 2015 subject to changes.

David Fotheringham seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with 7 Ayes and 0 Nays. Bryce Higbee, Jason Thelin, David Fotheringham, Steve Cospers, Steve Swanson, Jane Griener and Judi Pickell all voted Aye.

Steve Cospers stated that the Planning Commission had covered all of the items on the agenda and adjourned the meeting at 9:05 pm.